

TWPAG/2013/2

**REPORT OF THE TEACHER WORKFORCE  
PLANNING WORKING GROUP  
December 2013**

## **1. Introduction**

1.1 It was agreed at the Teacher Workforce Planning Advisory Group (TWP Advisory Group) meeting on 13 December 2012 that the current priority categorisation arrangements for Professional Graduate Diploma in Education (PGDE) secondary teaching subjects do not appear to reflect appropriately the relative demand for teachers across the range of subjects. The general view was that the effect of teacher recruitment difficulties in some subjects, eg home economics and physics, are being compounded year on year as a consequence of continual under-recruitment.

### **Aims and rationale**

1.2 The Teacher Workforce Planning Working Group (TWP Working Group) was established to conduct a strategic review of student teacher places for 2014 and beyond, including consideration of how to ensure that the appropriate number of teachers in each subject are trained.

1.3 At the Scottish Teacher Education Committee (STEC) Stakeholder Group meeting on 14 January 2013 the proposal to conduct a strategic review of the allocation of primary and secondary student teacher intakes to Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), and the prioritisation of secondary subjects, was welcomed.

### **Membership and remit of the Teacher Workforce Planning Working Group**

1.4 The membership of the TWP Working Group is shown at **Annex A**,

1.5 At the first meeting of the TWP Working Group (8 February 2013) consideration was given to a draft remit that had been distributed to members in advance. Reflecting on the discussion at the TWP Advisory Group meeting and the STEC Stakeholder Group meeting the following remit was agreed:

- To review the arrangements for the categorisation of priority subjects;
- To consider any barriers affecting student teacher recruitment to particular secondary courses;
- To consider how to take secondary, and new models of primary, concurrent degree courses into account in teacher workforce planning;
- To review the allocation of PGDE primary and secondary student teacher intakes to HEIs.
- To consider the potential merits of dual secondary subject teaching qualifications.

## **2. Background information on teacher workforce planning**

2.1 Teacher workforce planning is based on statistical modelling. It is undertaken at a national level, taking into account such factors as projected pupil rolls, the changing age and gender profile of the workforce and the numbers of leavers from and returners to the profession, to project the minimum number of newly trained teachers required. Teacher workforce planning cannot, however, be entirely accurate given that other factors also have an effect on teacher stocks.

2.2 It is also the case that the teacher workforce planning exercise has been influenced over recent years by successive Governments' policy initiatives such as the class sizes policy of the current Government and its impact on the requirement for teachers.

2.3 The TWP Advisory Group meets in December each year to consider both the statistical modelling and any other relevant evidence about teacher supply and demand. The deliberations and recommendations of the Group inform advice to Scottish Ministers and are reflected, as appropriate, in the Scottish Government's guidance to the Scottish Funding Council (SFC) on student teacher intake targets for initial teacher education (ITE) courses in the subsequent autumn.

2.4 Action was taken to decrease ITE places in 2009, 2010 and 2011 to address the worsening teacher unemployment situation. Since then evidence has suggested that the teacher surplus that was evident between 2008 and 2010 has been corrected and that teacher supply and demand are broadly in balance again. Given that primary school rolls are now rising again, student teacher intake numbers were increased in 2012 by 300 (200 in primary and 100 in secondary) and increased again in 2013 by a further 370 in primary. Primary school rolls are increasing and are projected to do so until 2020.

## **3. Consideration of the Teacher Workforce Planning Working Group**

3.1 As part of its review, the group considered a wide range of data gathered from a number of sources, including the General Teaching Council for Scotland (GTCS), local authorities (LAs), SFC and the Scottish Government, that might be seen to reflect the relative demand for teachers, a lot of which had been drawn together for the first time. The information included data on teacher replenishment rates, teacher vacancies, student teacher placements, probationers' LA preferences in the teacher induction scheme, probationer destinations and the assessment of indicators of the relative priority of secondary subjects.

3.2 While the Group recognised that there was a need to provide advice to the TWP Advisory Group about how the current priority subjects categorisation arrangements should be amended in the short term, they also wanted to put down a marker about the need for a more fundamental consideration of how Scotland's teacher workforce might be configured in the future. For example, the Group considered that as Curriculum for Excellence becomes fully embedded, and its aspirations in relation to cross-curricular and inter-disciplinary learning and teaching in our secondary schools become commonplace, the current norm of secondary teachers being qualified/registered in a single subject would no longer be fit for

purpose. Another example that the Group felt should be considered in the short to medium term was in relation to the transition between the primary and secondary sectors, and whether ITE and CPD providers (including LAs as employers) should re-design their provision to better equip teachers to support children and young people through this transition.

3.3 This following report of the TWP Working Group's deliberations and findings is structured on the five elements of the remit.

#### **4. To review the arrangements for the categorisation of priority subjects**

4.1 The annual guidance to SFC on ITE does not specify how many students should be recruited to each individual secondary subject. Within an HEI's share of the overall number of places on the 1 year PGDE secondary course, the numbers recruited to individual subjects is a matter for individual institutions. The Scottish Government does, however, influence the recruitment to courses by placing subjects in priority groupings and setting a target number of students for each group of subjects. The higher the group's priority, the higher the target is set. There is little evidence, however, of HEIs collaborating with each other to ensure that group targets are met. HEI's PGDE secondary subject intake and target intake numbers for each of the subject groups in academic sessions 2010/11 to 2013/14 are set out at **Annex B**. This shows under-recruitment to subjects in the top priority group over the last 3 academic sessions while there has been over-recruitment in subjects that have been categorised as medium to low priority for student teacher recruitment in the last 4 years at least.

4.2 The assessment of the priority of a subject for recruitment has been based on discussions over the years with LAs about staffing and the relative demand from LAs for probationers in different subjects as they join the teacher induction scheme. HEIs are encouraged to consult LAs within their vicinity about the demand for particular subjects to ensure that LAs' priorities are accommodated alongside conclusions that have been reached at a national level. The group noted that the new partnership arrangements that are currently being developed under *Teaching Scotland's Future* should lead to more meaningful discussions about the relevant demand for teachers across the range of secondary subjects.

4.3 It is evident that we are not recruiting the right number of teachers to each subject under the current arrangements used to categorise priority subjects. This, however, is not due solely to the categorisation arrangements, and some of the associated recruitment difficulties are discussed in section 5 of this report. Teacher recruitment difficulties in some subjects seem to be being compounded year on year. It may also be the case that schools are deciding not to offer certain subjects due to longstanding recruitment difficulties.

4.4 Between 2005 and 2010 the Scottish Government undertook an annual teacher vacancy survey in February which was used to help in the prioritisation of secondary subjects. The annual vacancy survey was discontinued to reduce the burden on LAs. The information received was also not considered particularly helpful given that it gave recorded vacancies as a percentage of complement - rather than of the staffing structure LAs would ideally have. As part of its review, the

TWP Working Group considered information on teacher vacancies gathered from posts advertised in Times Educational Supplement Scotland (TESS). However, LA representatives advised that this source could not be regarded as comprehensive. LAs have different policies on advertising vacancies therefore TESS advertisements will not capture all vacancies. The group agreed that there was a need to gather information on secondary vacancies across the country to shed further light on relative need across subjects. A request for vacancy data was issued to all LAs through the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland (ADES) Personnel Network, the results of which are at **Annex C**.

4.5 The group agreed that there appears to be over-provision of teacher numbers in some subjects and that HEIs should not continue to recruit to these subjects in such numbers while at the same time failing to provide the teacher numbers required in the subjects to which it is more difficult to recruit. **Annex D** compares student teacher intake numbers in 2012 for each subject with the number of teachers identified in the teacher census as teaching that subject as his or her 'first subject taught'. This shows 'replenishment rates' ranging from 2.39% (Business Education) to 9.86% (Physical Education) The group are of the view that it is inappropriate that replenishment rates vary so much and that there is a need to have a more sophisticated method of prioritising secondary subjects than the crude tool of grouping subjects as low, medium and high priority.

4.6 The group noted that teacher workforce planning has not been done on an individual subject basis and enquired about the feasibility of doing so. However, the Scottish Government statistician on the group explained that in smaller subject cohorts statistical modelling has been considered unreliable. Notwithstanding that to conduct teacher workforce planning at a subject by subject level would be unreliable, the group felt that something needed to be done to address the wide variation in replenishment rates referred to in paragraph 4.5 above, and a greater degree of prescription about the target intake numbers for each subject might be the best way forward.

4.7 Rationalisation of subjects offered by HEIs is a recurring issue which has been raised over the years. There is little evidence of HEIs working collaboratively on provision across subjects. Rationalisation will need national negotiation and agreement, and will have to be monitored to ensure the maintenance of adequate provision of teachers in subjects. It was noted that rationalisation in relation to which universities are providing which subjects, eg universities becoming providers of particular subjects, would impact differently at each university. **Annex E** shows provision at HEIs in academic session 2012/13.

4.8 The group also noted that for classes at HEIs to be viable they have to lie within a certain size range. Numbers have to be large enough for a class to be viable while too large may lead to having to split a class in two which can result in a financial loss. It was noted that this has potential implications for decisions about how many providers should offer each subject. It also means that small increases and decreases in student numbers can be problematic.

4.9 The Group noted that STEC had indicated that they intend to set up a working group to consider rationalisation of secondary subject provision across the HEIs. The Group welcomed this initiative and urged STEC to involve the Scottish Government and the SFC at appropriate stages in their deliberations.

4.10 The Scottish Government is taking a measured approach to student teacher places and continues to monitor the situation to avoid a return to the previous boom and bust situation. The system, however, needs to ensure that it delivers teachers to meet the demand for all secondary subjects in schools. While the statistical modelling in last year's teacher workforce planning exercise suggested that secondary PGDE intake numbers could be reduced back down to baseline level (815) for 2013 and 2014, Ministers were reluctant to recommend such a cut, given that numbers will have to rise again in the near future. There has been a great deal of volatility in relation to intake numbers in recent years and Ministers are keen to see intake numbers stabilised as far as possible. Accordingly, the Government's view was that the overall 2013 target should be the same as in 2012 (915) although this is 100 above the level indicated by the modelling exercise. HEIs were asked to target the additional places at specific priorities, home economics, modern languages, physics, business education, chemistry, art and computing. This appears to have had some limited success and suggests that there would be merit in moving towards a more explicit breakdown by subjects of the overall number of secondary student teachers. Should there be any rise in student teacher places in session 2014 the additional places should be made available to priority subjects and places that allow dual secondary subjects qualifications.

### **Recommendations:**

- **1. That the Scottish Government should change the way in which they present advice on priority secondary subjects in their guidance letter to the SFC to better reflect the current relative shortages of subject teachers.**
- **2. That for a trial period SFC should not penalise HEIs for breaches of consolidation that have been caused by over-recruitment in 'hard to fill' secondary subjects (eg physics, computing, home economics and business education) - as is the case for Gaelic at present. This approach should be assessed for affordability during the trial period and, if the outcome of this review is satisfactory, this approach should be extended beyond the trial period.**
- **3. That the Scottish Government should specify a national target intake number for each individual secondary subject rather than setting a target for each group of subjects.**
- **4. That any increase in secondary PGDE intakes should be targeted at priority subjects and/or dual secondary subject qualifications.**

- 5. That HEIs should share with each other the monthly returns that they provide to the Scottish Government about their recruitment to secondary subjects to ensure that national target allocations are met more closely.
- 6. That the proposed STEC working group that is being established to consider rationalisation of PGDE Secondary subject provision across the HEIs should engage with the Scottish Government and SFC as they take forward their work.

## **5. To consider any barriers affecting student teacher recruitment to particular secondary courses**

5.1 Overall the teaching profession in Scotland does not face problems in attracting applicants. However, some subjects are exceptions to this generality and the recruitment of teachers to those subjects, and in some geographical areas, is difficult. The supply of secondary subject teachers needs to meet demand across the country.

5.2 Potential teachers are also candidates for positions in professions other than teaching. As a graduate profession, teaching is in competition with other occupations/professions such as the off-shore oil/gas industry, financial services sector etc. Applicant volumes in certain subjects may be influenced over time by changing economic circumstances, and there may be a need to raise the profile of teaching in some subjects where other possible careers are more financially rewarding.

5.3 It was noted that universities invest varying degrees of time and effort trying to attract applicants from other university departments, schools and colleges. In addition, the Scottish Government attends careers fairs to promote teaching. The Group agreed that HEIs could be more pro-active in targeting students both in their own institution and in others.

5.4 The Scottish Government manages a small recruitment team of teachers who attend careers fairs and other events to give people information about a career in teaching. The team, who work on behalf of the Scottish Government, inform people about entry requirements to initial teacher education courses, what to expect from a career in teaching and any other knowledge that someone may require in order to make a decision about becoming a teacher. From time to time there have been Government initiatives to encourage people with an interest in specific subjects to consider a career in teaching, e.g. in the priority subjects, and the team will actively promote such initiatives through their attendance at events.

## **Wider access to ITE**

5.5 Many potential candidates are unable to undertake a traditional campus based course of ITE as they live too far from a university that provides teacher education and personal circumstances preclude them from living and studying away from home.

5.6 There are examples of ITE offered by different modes of delivery:

- The Open University PGDE in Mathematics is offered as a one year full time or two year part time programme. Distance learning study of the theory of teaching and learning is integrated with its practical application during sustained periods of teaching in two partner schools.
- The University of the Highlands and Islands (UHI) PGDE Primary course consists of 18 weeks study at a UHI partner institution, plus 18 weeks in professional practice in schools in the Highlands and Islands and Morayshire. For the taught element of the course, study is through a combination of face to face and video conference lectures, and online study through the UHI virtual learning environment. Along with providing another avenue of access to Gaelic medium provision a course of this nature also widens access to teacher education for those in more rural areas.

5.7 In addition to these existing examples, the University of Aberdeen have established a project which entails working in partnership with Highland Council and Aberdeenshire Council to review distance learning provision: DLITE (Distance Learning ITE) PGDE. The review will be conducted with an explicit objective of creating a new model of partnership which spans both ITE and teacher induction. The DLITE ITE provision will be targeted at suitably qualified existing employees and residents of the partner LAs with a view to creating “home grown” teachers, by means of an 18 month part-time programme, and thereby addressing the significant difficulties they face in teacher recruitment and retention. The project will lead to a sustainable model of early phase teacher development which will be technology-enabled and cost effective; enhance partnerships between the local authorities and the universities; and be suitable for roll-out to other local authorities.

5.8 On the basis of the DLITE programme, the University of Aberdeen are in discussion with Aberdeen City Council to consider viable and quality assured means of validating teachers who have gained recognition outwith Scotland but do not hold the relevant professional qualifications to meet the GTCS requirements for registration.

5.9 The group acknowledged that new models of ITE provision could, potentially, have implications for teachers - eg if the support that these student teachers require when on placement differs from that required by students on university-based ITE courses - and were of the view that LAs, in developing new models of ITE provision such as this, should be alert to any potential sensitivities and consider engaging with their Local Negotiating Committee for Teachers (LNCT) as appropriate.



5.10 The group were concerned that the limited financial student support that is available for part-time/distance learning courses and that having to undertake student placements on a full-time basis may be possible barriers to recruitment of part-time ITE students.

### **Recommendation:**

- **7. That the Scottish Government liaises with ADES about how teachers who offer careers guidance in schools can best be kept informed about entry requirements and other relevant information relating to courses of initial teacher education so that pupils can be suitably advised at appropriate stages of their schooling about what subject choices they should be making if they think they might wish to pursue a career in teaching.**
- **8. That HEIs, in partnership with LAs, should explore offering ITE courses through a wider, more flexible range of modes of delivery, including distance learning, part-time courses and making greater use of information and communication technology; and that the GTCS should consider promoting this in their next revision of the Guidelines for ITE Programmes in Scotland.**
- **9. SAAS/Scottish Government should re-consider the current support arrangements for part-time PGDE students in general and, in particular, the potential loss of earnings associated with the fact that student placements, extending to duration of 18 weeks during the course, have to be undertaken on a full-time basis.**
- **10. GTCS should consider whether full-time student placements are absolutely essential on part-time/distance learning teacher education courses.**

### **Recruitment and retention**

5.11 The group noted that one option to address the shortage of applicants in subjects such as physics would be to offer financial incentives to physics graduates embarking on a PGDE course. It was noted that in England, depending on degree subject and classification, some graduates entering teacher education can be eligible for a scholarship award of up to £20,000, while others may be eligible for government bursaries of up to £25,000.

5.12 The Scottish Government has not considered it necessary to replicate the incentives offered in England because, over the years, Scottish HEIs have not experienced the same degree of difficulty in recruiting students, neither have Scottish LAs experienced the same degree of difficulty in recruiting teachers, as their counterparts in England.

5.13 It was noted, however, that if this approach were to be adopted it would be important to pay particular attention to the retention situation. There would be little point spending scarce resources to attract more physics graduates onto PGDE courses if they were likely to leave the profession once they had qualified or after their induction year.

### **Recommendations:**

- **11. That HEIs consider again how best they can attract undergraduate students from elsewhere in their institutions, and in other institutions, to apply for entry to their PGDE Secondary courses and that under the auspices of STEC they share best practice with each other. There is a need to focus harder on recruitment in certain subject areas where difficulty is being experienced. A collective approach (including the Scottish Government, university careers services, HEIs and LAs) to promoting/advertising teaching in specific subjects is needed at a national level (based on information provided by HEIs and LAs).**
- **12. That the Scottish Government undertakes a review of how it and other agencies and partners (eg Skills Development Scotland) promote teaching as a career choice to school pupils, university students and the wider population to ensure that appropriately positive messages are being conveyed (eg that the high level of teacher unemployment in the period 2009-2011 has been remedied and that employment prospects for new teachers are now very good); and consider the possible merit of targeted advertising in relation to specific subjects.**
- **13. That work is undertaken to establish the effectiveness of financial incentives offered to attract PGCE students in England, recognising that it is important to understand their effectiveness not only in terms of recruitment to courses but also in terms of retention in the teaching workforce; and evidence is sought about comparable incentive schemes elsewhere, whether in relation to teaching or other professions.**

### **6. To consider how to take secondary and new models of primary, concurrent degree courses into account in teacher workforce planning**

6.1 Until recently, secondary combined/concurrent degrees were not taken into account in teacher workforce planning but were, loosely, off-set against requirements for teachers in the independent sector.

6.2 Traditional BEd primary degrees are being replaced by new models of initial teacher education along the lines of combined/concurrent degrees. If a difference in conversion rate (ie the proportion of first year students going forward to the teacher induction scheme) becomes evident following the change this could have considerable implications for teacher workforce planning for the primary sector.

6.3 There are two ways of addressing this. One option is to increase the number of students recruited to the courses. The other is to compensate for the lower

conversion rate by increasing the number of PGDE students recruited. The group are of the view that over the next few years conversion rates into teaching should be carefully monitored following the move away from traditional BEd degrees.

6.4 The other issue in relation to secondary combined/concurrent degrees is that the number of students is not factored in to the priority subject groupings, and the target totals set for each grouping, as laid out the SFC Circular. The Group agreed that it did not make sense that the students on combined/concurrent courses were not counted in with the PGDE students.

### **Recommendations:**

- **14. That all courses leading to a Teaching Qualification should be taken into account in the annual teacher workforce planning exercise - both in terms of overall numbers and in terms of individual secondary subjects.**
- **15. That the consequences of the move away from traditional BEd degrees, eg any decline in conversion rates in to teaching, should be closely monitored over the next few years and consideration should be given by the TWP Advisory Group as to whether it should be compensated for by increasing intakes to PGDE courses or the new four year courses.**

### **7. To review the allocation of PGDE primary and secondary student teacher intakes to HEIs**

7.1 Achieving the appropriate distribution of teachers across the country presents a challenge. In Scotland there are 9 ITE providers, the Universities of Aberdeen, Dundee, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Stirling, Strathclyde, the West of Scotland, the Highlands and Islands and the Open University in Scotland. Evidence shows that qualified teachers seek careers close to their home and university areas. This plays a part in some LAs finding it difficult to recruit teachers in their areas.

7.2 The group noted that both Aberdeen City and Aberdeenshire Councils had resorted to innovative, but not unprecedented, teacher recruitment practices during the summer (2013). However, this was not thought to be sufficient evidence on which to conclude that more teachers should be trained in Aberdeen given that other LAs, including some in the central belt, have experienced severe recruitment difficulties too.

7.3 The current proportional allocation of student intake places to individual HEIs is made on an inherited historic basis, any criteria for which have been lost in time. Allocations have not been significantly reshaped for at least 20 years and are not necessarily fit for purpose now. There needs to be a transparent rationale in the allocation of intake numbers to HEIs which provides a balance of provision that is right in current times. The changes in the rationale for allocating ITE places could have varying impacts on each HEI.

7.4 It was agreed that analytical work should be undertaken to reappraise what the most appropriate distribution would be of student places amongst the ITE providers. This would need to take account of a wide range of factors including the distribution of the population of Scotland, the distribution of schools across Scotland and the number of teachers employed by LAs across Scotland. It was noted, however, that resources were not available at the current time for this to be carried out during 2013.

7.5 The rebalancing in student teacher intakes is not an exercise that would take place each year resulting in significant changes year on year. HEIs have an open mind about changing the size and nature of provision of ITE across providers; however planning and lead-in times are key.

7.6 It was noted that:

- the level at which decisions are made about the scale of ITE provision differs between HEIs. In some cases decisions were made by the school of education and in others they were driven by central university policy and involve senior management/planners.
- there would need to be sufficient lead-in time for any significant changes to the distribution of student places amongst HEIs to take place and that any decisions about re-distribution should allow for the fact that student class sizes should not be too large or too small.
- HEIs prefer student intake numbers to be stable - big fluctuations in numbers cause difficulty eg in staffing levels.
- taking in more students does not necessarily lead to economies of scale because it can lead to the need to have more classes, and more staff, which can lead to financial loss for the HEI.

**Recommendation:**

- **16. Further analytical work should be undertaken to inform any redistribution of student teacher places at HEIs. The Scottish Government and SFC should work together with HEIs to take forward this work during 2014.**

## **8. Dual secondary subject teaching qualifications**

8.1 It was noted that fewer teachers have dual subject qualifications than in the past. The following reasons were cited by HEIs as contributing to this situation:

- extra costs of visits (a student doing 2 subjects needs an extra visit);
- the induction year arrangements mean that students can only achieve full registration in one subject during the induction year;
- the GTCS has developed their 'professional recognition', which means that second subjects can be obtained quite straightforwardly -- indeed getting rid of the Additional Teaching Qualification (ATQ) programme run by many of the HEIs;
- the HEIs' emphasis on research for the Research Excellence Framework means that time is squeezed dramatically;
- a perception that schools/LAs didn't want dual qualifications.

8.2 LA representatives indicated that from the employers' perspective, teachers with a teaching qualification in more than one subject provide a resource that can be used to advantage in the changing environment of Curriculum for Excellence, in cross curricular activities and in ways that can meet specific needs by enhanced timetabling options in schools, a facility that is especially useful in smaller secondary schools. It was also agreed that dual qualification is likely to increase a teacher's employment and promotion prospects.

8.3 It was also noted that the Commission on the Delivery of Rural Education had recommended that LAs should work in partnership with HEIs and GTCS to facilitate and support a streamlined process for teachers who have the appropriate skills and wish to gain a dual qualification.

### **Recommendations:**

- **17. That HEIs should consider developing their PGDE programmes in a way that will enable more students to pursue dual subject qualification.**
- **18. That HEIs should work with LAs to establish the most appropriate subject combinations and to assess the potential level of demand/provision.**
- **19. That the GTCS should reconsider whether full registration could be achieved in two subjects during the induction year.**
- **20. That LAs should recognise that job advertisements need not be targeted solely at teachers who are fully registered in a particular subject. A teacher with full registration in one subject and provisional registration in a second subject can, quite legitimately, be employed to teach their second subject.**

## **9. Summary of conclusions/recommendations**

9.1 Having met on five occasions the Group feel they have made as thorough an exploration of the remit as possible within the time available and has made the following recommendations:

### **To review the arrangements for the categorisation of priority subjects**

- 1. That the Scottish Government should change the way in which they present advice on priority secondary subjects in their guidance letter to the SFC to better reflect the current relative shortages of subject teachers.
- 2. That for a trial period SFC should not penalise HEIs for breaches of consolidation that have been caused by over-recruitment in 'hard to fill' secondary subjects (eg physics, computing, home economics and business education) - as is the case for Gaelic at present. This approach should be assessed for affordability during the trial period and, if the outcome of this review is satisfactory, this approach should be extended beyond the trial period.
- 3. That the Scottish Government should specify a national target intake number for each individual secondary subject rather than setting a target for each group of subjects.
- 4. That any increase in secondary PGDE intakes should be targeted at priority subjects and/or dual secondary subject qualifications.
- 5. That HEIs should share with each other the monthly returns that they provide to the Scottish Government about their recruitment to secondary subjects to ensure that national target allocations are met more closely.
- 6. That the proposed STEC working group that is being established to consider rationalisation of PGDE Secondary subject provision across the HEIs should engage with the Scottish Government and SFC as they take forward their work.

**To consider any barriers affecting student teacher recruitment to particular secondary courses**

- 7. That the Scottish Government liaises with ADES about how teachers who offer careers guidance in schools can best be kept informed about entry requirements and other relevant information relating to courses of initial teacher education so that pupils can be suitably advised at appropriate stages of their schooling about what subject choices they should be making if they think they might wish to pursue a career in teaching.
- 8. That HEIs, in partnership with LAs, should explore offering ITE courses through a wider, more flexible range of modes of delivery, including distance learning, part-time courses and making greater use of information and communication technology; and that the GTCS should consider promoting this in their next revision of the Guidelines for ITE Programmes in Scotland.
- 9. SAAS/Scottish Government should re-consider the current support arrangements for part-time PGDE students in general and, in particular, the potential loss of earnings associated with the fact that student placements, extending to duration of 18 weeks during the course, have to be undertaken on a full-time basis.
- 10. GTCS should consider whether full-time student placements are absolutely essential on part-time/distance learning teacher education courses.
- 11. That HEIs consider again how best they can attract undergraduate students from elsewhere in their institutions, and in other institutions, to apply for entry to their PGDE Secondary courses and that under the auspices of STEC they share best practice with each other. There is a need to focus harder on recruitment in certain subject areas where difficulty is being experienced. A collective approach (including the Scottish Government, university careers services, HEIs and LAs) to promoting/advertising teaching in specific subjects is needed at a national level (based on information provided by HEIs and LAs).
- 12. That the Scottish Government undertakes a review of how it and other agencies and partners (eg Skills Development Scotland) promote teaching as a career choice to school pupils, university students and the wider population to ensure that appropriately positive messages are being conveyed (eg that the high level of teacher unemployment in the period 2009-2011 has been remedied and that employment prospects for new teachers are now very good); and consider the possible merit of targeted advertising in relation to specific subjects.

- 13. That work is undertaken to establish the effectiveness of financial incentives offered to attract PGCE students in England, recognising that it is important to understand their effectiveness not only in terms of recruitment to courses but also in terms of retention in the teaching workforce; and evidence is sought about comparable incentive schemes elsewhere, whether in relation to teaching or other professions.

**To consider how to take secondary and new models of primary, concurrent degree courses into account in teacher workforce planning**

- 14. That all courses leading to a Teaching Qualification should be taken into account in the annual teacher workforce planning exercise - both in terms of overall numbers and in terms of individual secondary subjects.
- 15. That the consequences of the move away from traditional BEd degrees, eg any decline in conversion rates in to teaching, should be closely monitored over the next few years and consideration should be given by the TWP Advisory Group as to whether it should be compensated for by increasing intakes to PGDE courses or the new four year courses.

**To review the allocation of PGDE primary and secondary student teacher intakes to HEIs**

- 16. Further analytical work should be undertaken to inform any redistribution of student teacher places at HEIs. The Scottish Government and SFC should work together with HEIs to take forward this work during 2014.

**Dual secondary subject teaching qualifications**

- 17. That HEIs should consider developing their PGDE programmes in a way that will enable more students to pursue dual subject qualification.
- 18. That HEIs should work with LAs to establish the most appropriate subject combinations and to assess the potential level of demand/provision.
- 19. That the GTCS should reconsider whether full registration could be achieved in two subjects during the induction year.
- 20. That LAs should recognise that job advertisements need not be targeted solely at teachers who are fully registered in a particular subject. A teacher with full registration in one subject and provisional registration in a second subject can, quite legitimately, be employed to teach their second subject.



## Membership

<b>Name</b>	<b>Representing</b>
Caroline Amos	SLS
Mary Arthur	ADES
Yvonne Bain Sharon Smith	University of Aberdeen
Linda Brownlow	University of Strathclyde
Leonard Franchi	University of Glasgow
Lore Gallastegi	Open University
Tom Hamilton Mairi McAra	GTCS
Lesley Johnstone Zoe Williamson	Education Scotland
Elaine Kirkham	ADES
Sarah Kirkpatrick	SFC
Henry Maitles Jim Maclean	University of West of Scotland
Teresa Moran	University of Dundee
Drew Morrice Dave McGinty	Teachers Panel
Jane O'Donnell John Wood Mirren Kelly	COSLA
John Ravenscroft Nigel Parton Mike Lynch	University of Edinburgh
Wilf Weir	ADES
Gary Wilson Richard Edwards	University of Stirling
John Gunstone; Chair	Scottish Government
Elisabeth Boyling	Scottish Government
Ann Hunter, Secretary	Scottish Government

Receiving papers: Greg Dempster, AHDS  
David Lott, Universities Scotland

## Meetings

The group met on five occasions; 8 February; 15 April, 10 June, 2 September and 4 November 2013.

ANNEX B

PGDE Secondary: actual intakes vs target intakes

	2013/14		2012/13		2011/12		2010/11	
	HEI PGDE Secondary Intakes (1)	Target PGDE Secondary Intakes (2)	HEI PGDE Secondary Intakes (1)	Target PGDE Secondary Intakes (2)	HEI PGDE Secondary Intakes (1)	Target PGDE Secondary Intakes (2)	HEI PGDE Secondary Intakes (1)	Target PGDE Secondary Intakes (2)
Gaelic	3	10	3	10	6	10	4	10
English	127		131		119		133	
Home Economics	48		52		29		30	
Maths	108		112		113		114	
Modern Languages	68		77		68		63	
Physical Education (also has BEd)	56		55		51		44	
Physics	38		32		38		48	
Technological Education (also has BEd)	30		36		30		34	
<b>Group Total</b>	<b>475</b>	<b>510</b>	<b>495</b>	<b>535</b>	<b>448</b>	<b>455</b>	<b>466</b>	<b>440</b>
Biology	72		74		66		51	
Business Education	18		17		23		19	
Chemistry	55		46		51		56	
Geography	46		51		48		48	
History	58		54		58		54	
Religious Education	28		34		36		34	
<b>Group Total</b>	<b>277</b>	<b>270</b>	<b>276</b>	<b>260</b>	<b>282</b>	<b>240</b>	<b>262</b>	<b>240</b>
Art	57		53		41		33	
Classics	0		0		0		0	
Computing	17		17		19		17	
Drama	23		27		16		25	
Modern Studies	33		31		25		28	
Music (also has BEd)	31		27		19		21	
<b>Group Total</b>	<b>161</b>	<b>130</b>	<b>155</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>110</b>	<b>124</b>	<b>110</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>916</b>	<b>920</b>	<b>929</b>	<b>925</b>	<b>856</b>	<b>815</b>	<b>856</b>	<b>800</b>

Sources:

(1) HEI annual return to the Scottish Government: (2) Scottish Ministers' guidance letter on ITE to SFC

## ANNEX C

### Collated response from 15 local authorities to vacancy survey for 2012/13:

Aberdeen City, Angus, Dumfries & Galloway, East Dunbartonshire, East Renfrewshire, Falkirk, Highland, Inverclyde, North Ayrshire, Perth & Kinross, Renfrewshire, Shetland Islands, South Ayrshire, West Dunbartonshire, West Lothian

A SUBJECT	B TOTAL NUMBER OF PERMANENT VACANCIES ADVERTISED	C TOTAL NUMBER OF TEMPORARY /FIXED TERM VACANCIES ADVERTISED	D OF THE TOTALS IN COLUMNS B & C HOW MANY WERE DENOMIN- ATIONAL	E TOTAL NUMBER OF VACANCIES IN COLUMNS B & C ADVERTISED MORE THAN 2 TIMES	F SUBJECT AVAILABILITY REDUCED IN SCHOOL/S BECAUSE OF TEACHER SHORTAGE YES/NO		G SUBJECT DROPPED FROM CURRICULUM BECAUSE OF TEACHER SHORTAGE YES/NO	
					Yes	No	Yes	No
ART & DESIGN	32	28	6	2	1			
BIOLOGY	33	40	12	3	1			
BUSINESS EDUCATION	31	17	8	2	3		1	
CHEMISTRY	24	16	4	3	2		1	
CHEMISTRY//BIOLOGY	1	2	1					
COMPUTING	10	14	4		2		2	
DRAMA	20	10	1	3	1			
ENGLISH	73	59	23	7				
FRENCH	21	18	1	3	1			
GAELIC	4	5		1	1		1	
GERMAN	4				1		2	
GEOGRAPHY	23	17	5	1				
GEOGRAPHY/MODERN STUDIES	1							
HISTORY	18	16	7	2	1		1	
HISTORY/MODERN STUDIES	1	2						
HOME ECONOMICS	28	21	7	4	3			
ITALIAN					1			
MANDARIN	1		1					
MATHEMATICS	41	40	6	6				
MODERN LANGUAGES	11	10	3					
MODERN STUDIES	10	12	1	2				
MODERN STUDIES/HISTORY	3	2	1					
MUSIC	25	23	6	2	2			
PHYSICAL EDUCATION	37	29	16		1			
PHYSICS	47	18	9	3	1			
RELIGIOUS EDUCATION	12	10	4	1	1			
RELIGIOUS EDUCATION/ENGLISH	1		1					
SCIENCE	4	1						
SCIENCE/CHEMISTRY /PHYSICS	1							
TECHNOLOGICAL EDUCATION	40	20	6	3	2			
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>557</b>	<b>430</b>	<b>133</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>0</b>

ANNEX D

2012/13 students teacher intakes vs teachers by subject in teacher census (replenishment rate)

Subjects in alphabetical order

Subjects ranked in 'replenishment' order

	Students	Teachers	Replenish
Art	53	1,108	4.78%
Biology	78	1,212	6.44%
Business Education	21	878	2.39%
Chemistry	46	973	4.73%
Computing	19	675	2.81%
Drama	27	371	7.28%
English	147	2,678	5.49%
Gaelic	3	60	5.00%
Geography	67	758	8.84%
History	69	817	8.45%
Home Economics	52	898	5.79%
Maths	121	2,533	4.78%
Modern Languages	84	1,421	5.91%
Modern Studies	31	535	5.79%
Music	60	862	6.96%
Physical Education	168	1,704	9.86%
Physics	37	891	4.15%
Religious Education	56	665	8.42%
Technological Education	68	1,305	5.21%
Sec. Ed with subject	4		
	1,211	20,344	5.95%

Ranking	Student	Teachers	Replenish	*5.95%	more/less
Business Education	21	878	2.39%	52	31
Computing	19	675	2.81%	40	21
Physics	37	891	4.15%	53	16
Chemistry	46	973	4.73%	58	12
Art	53	1,108	4.78%	66	13
Maths	121	2,533	4.78%	151	30
Gaelic	3	60	5.00%	4	1
Technological Education	68	1,305	5.21%	78	10
English	147	2,678	5.49%	159	12
Home Economics	52	898	5.79%	53	1
Modern Studies	31	535	5.79%	32	1
Modern Languages	84	1,421	5.91%	85	1
Biology	78	1,212	6.44%	72	-6
Music	60	862	6.96%	51	-9
Drama	27	371	7.28%	22	-5
Religious Education	56	665	8.42%	40	-16
History	69	817	8.45%	49	-20
Geography	67	758	8.84%	45	-22
Physical Education	168	1,704	9.86%	101	-67

1,210 1,210

\* The '5.95%' column indicates number of students if average replenishment rate had been applied to all subjects

2012/13: student intakes (PGDE Secondary) and 4th year starts (other secondary ITE courses)

ANNEX E

	Aberdeen PGDE	Dundee PGDE	Edinburgh PGDE	Glasgow PGDE	Open PGDE	Strathclyde PGDE	West of Scotland PGDE	PGDE total	Aberdeen B Music 4th year	Aberdeen MA/BSc Secondary Ed with Subject	Edinburgh BEd PE 4th year	Edinburgh BEd Tech Ed 4th year	Glasgow BEd Music 4th year	Glasgow BEd Tech 4th year	Glasgow Combined R&Ph Ed	Stirling Combined - Ed with subject 4th year	Strathclyde BSc Chemistry with TQ	Strathclyde BSc Maths with TQ	Strathclyde BSc Physics with TQ	Secondary total	
Art			13	9		20	11	53													53
Biology	12		15	10		25	12	74								4					78
Business Education	10			7				17								4					21
Chemistry	3	5	10	9		19		46									0				46
Computing				8		9		17								2					19
Drama	8		19					27													27
English	15		21	19		62	14	131								16					147
Gaelic						3		3													3
Geography	11		7	10		23		51								16					67
History	10		10	9		25		54								15					69
Home Economics	11	11				30		52													52
Maths	14	8	15	21	6	41	7	112								5		4			121
Modern Languages	11		17	26		23		77								7					84
Modern Studies	9			8		14		31													31
Music			15			12		27	15				18								60
Physical Education			22			22	11	55			94					19					168
Physics	2	5	9	8		8		32												5	37
Religious Education	10			6		18		34							10	12					56
Technical Education			12			24		36				3		29							68
Sec Ed with subject										4											4
Total	126	29	185	150	6	378	55	929	15	4	94	3	18	29	10	100	0	4	5		1,211

